

# New Media and Freedom of Expression

*Rethinking the Constitutional  
Foundations of the Public Sphere*

András Koltay

• HART •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

1150935

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2019

Copyright © András Koltay, 2019

András Koltay has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union,  
<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2019.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Koltay, András, 1978-

Title: New media and freedom of expression : rethinking the constitutional foundations of the public sphere / András Koltay.

Description: Oxford, UK ; Chicago, Illinois : Hart Publishing, 2019. | Series: Hart studies in comparative public law ; volume 25 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019007723 (print) | LCCN 2019009138 (ebook) | ISBN 9781509916504 (EPub) | ISBN 9781509916481 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Digital media—Law and legislation. | Freedom of expression—Law and legislation. | Social media—Law and legislation. | Electronic information resource searching—Law and legislation. | Internet service providers—Law and legislation.

Classification: LCC K4240 (ebook) | LCC K4240 .K654 2019 (print) | DDC 342.08/53—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019007723>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-50991-648-1  
ePDF: 978-1-50991-649-8  
ePub: 978-1-50991-650-4

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY



To find out more about our authors and books visit [www.hartpublishing.co.uk](http://www.hartpublishing.co.uk). Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

# *Table of Contents*

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i> .....	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	<i>xv</i>
Introduction .....	1
1. The Foundations of Free Speech and Freedom of the Press .....	8
I. Freedom of Speech in the Age of the Internet .....	8
A. Searching for the Truth .....	8
B. Operation of Democracy .....	11
C. The Individualist Theory .....	12
D. Justifications of the Freedom of Speech: Theory and Practice .....	13
E. Reconciling the Justifications .....	14
II. The Category of ‘Speech’ and the Scope of Protection .....	15
A. Terminological Variations .....	15
B. The Category of ‘Speech’ .....	16
i. Speech and ‘Speech’ .....	16
ii. ‘Speech’ and Action .....	17
C. Categories and Protection .....	18
D. The Open Debate of Public Affairs as the Core of Freedom of Speech .....	20
E. Internet-Specific Questions .....	22
III. Limitation of the Freedom of Speech .....	24
A. The Protection of Freedom of Speech in Different Legal Systems .....	24
i. The United States .....	24
ii. The United Kingdom .....	25
iii. The European Court of Human Rights .....	27
iv. The European Union .....	28
B. The Protection of Reputation and Honour .....	29
C. The Protection of Privacy .....	32
D. Instigation to Violence or a Criminal Offence and Threats Thereof .....	34
E. Hate Speech .....	36
F. Symbolic Speech .....	38
G. False Statements .....	39
H. Public Morals and Protection of Minors .....	40
i. The Protection of Public Morals .....	40
ii. Paedophilia .....	41
I. Commercial Communication .....	42

viii *Table of Contents*

IV. Freedom of the Press and Media Regulation .....	44
A. Freedom of Speech – Freedom of the Press .....	44
B. The Concept of the Media, the Rights Holders of the Freedom of the Press .....	46
C. Differentiated Regulation of Individual Media .....	50
D. Censorship and Prior Restraint .....	50
E. Special Privileges Awarded to the Media .....	52
i. The Protection of Information Sources .....	53
ii. Exemption from House Searches .....	53
iii. Investigative Journalism .....	54
F. The Principal Foundations of Special Privileges Awarded to the Media .....	54
G. Content Regulation of the Media .....	57
i. Protection of Minors .....	57
ii. Hate Speech .....	58
H. Media Pluralism .....	59
2. The Regulation of the Internet and its Gatekeepers in the Context of the Freedom of Speech .....	65
I. Online Content Providers as ‘Media’ .....	65
A. Introduction .....	65
B. Frontier, Architecture, Feudalism and Other Metaphors .....	67
C. Initial Hopes and the Reality of the Internet .....	70
D. Old Problems in a New Context .....	72
E. New Problems on the Horizon .....	74
i. A Decline of Professional Media? .....	74
ii. Social Fragmentation and Polarisation .....	75
iii. The Issue of Applicable Law .....	76
F. Regulatory Analogies and Starting Points .....	77
i. On the Freedom of the Internet .....	77
ii. Internet Services as the Subjects of the Freedom of Speech and the Press .....	79
iii. Applying the Limits of Offline Speech in an Online Environment .....	79
iv. Media, Platform and General Regulations with an Impact on the Internet .....	80
v. Internet Access as a Fundamental Right? .....	81
II. The Regulation of Internet Gatekeepers .....	82
A. The Roles and Types of Gatekeepers .....	82
B. The ‘Freedom of Speech’ of Gatekeepers and Algorithms .....	84
C. The Problems of the Media Survive in the Activities of Gatekeepers .....	87
i. Media or Tech Companies? .....	87
ii. Government Intervention .....	88
iii. Private Censorship .....	88

iv. Diversity and Pluralism .....	90
v. Impact on the Audience.....	90
D. Analogies in Media Regulation and Regulatory Ideas.....	91
i. 'Editing' .....	91
ii. Previous Analogies in Media Regulation.....	92
iii. Recommendations of the Council of Europe .....	93
E. The Liability of Gatekeepers in General.....	94
i. The European Union.....	94
ii. The United States.....	98
3. Internet Service Providers.....	102
I. Introduction.....	102
II. Obligations of the Internet Service Providers Regarding Illegal Content .....	103
A. Blocking and Filtering .....	103
B. Self-regulation.....	105
C. Injunctions against Internet Service Providers.....	106
III. The Problem of Network Neutrality .....	109
A. Theoretical Questions .....	109
B. Regulation in the United States .....	111
C. Regulation in Europe.....	112
IV. Censorship by Internet Service Providers .....	113
4. Search Engines.....	115
I. Introduction – The Role of Search Engines in Online Public Sphere .....	115
II. Search Results as <i>Speech</i> .....	117
A. Search for Analogies .....	117
B. Search Results as Opinions .....	120
C. The Regulation of Search Engines.....	122
III. The Liability of Search Engines for Violations of Personality Rights .....	124
A. Search Engines as Publishers.....	124
B. Defamatory Search Results.....	126
C. Defamatory Autocomplete Suggestions.....	129
D. Other Violating Content.....	131
E. The Right to Be Forgotten .....	132
IV. The Manipulation of Search Results .....	137
A. The Issue of Search Engine Neutrality .....	137
B. External Manipulation .....	141
C. Internal Manipulation.....	141
V. Summary .....	145
5. Social Media Platforms.....	146
I. Introduction .....	146
II. Social Media Platforms and the Democratic Public Sphere.....	147
A. New Forms of Speech and the Expansion of the Public Sphere .....	147

x *Table of Contents*

B.	‘Bubbles’ and Other Psychological Effects of Social Media Platforms .....	149
C.	Social Media as a Public Forum .....	152
D.	‘Cheap Speech’ and the Traditional Media .....	154
E.	Tech or Media Companies? .....	157
III.	The Regulation of Platforms by Legislation.....	159
A.	Introduction.....	159
B.	Applicable Legislation .....	160
C.	Jurisdictional Issues.....	165
D.	Protection of Reputation .....	167
E.	Protection of Privacy .....	170
F.	Threats, Hate Speech and Other Violent Content Breaching Public Order .....	173
G.	Fake News .....	177
IV.	Private Regulation by Platforms .....	180
A.	Introduction.....	180
B.	The Legal Basis of Private Regulation: Contract Terms and Conditions .....	183
C.	Moderation and Private Censorship.....	187
i.	The Pros and Cons of Moderation .....	187
ii.	The Legal Status of Moderation – Possible Analogies .....	188
iii.	Community Standards and Codes of Conduct .....	190
D.	Editing and Content Diversity on Social Media Platforms .....	194
E.	Fake News and Private Regulation .....	197
F.	The Ideology of a Platform.....	199
V.	Summary .....	200
6.	Gatekeepers’ Responsibility for Online Comments .....	202
I.	The Case of Online Comments.....	202
A.	Comments as ‘Speech’ .....	202
B.	Anonymity .....	202
C.	Moderation.....	204
D.	Basis of Legal Responsibility for Unlawful Comments.....	205
II.	The European Court of Human Rights Case Law Relating to Comments – Overview .....	209
III.	The Relevant Criteria in the Cases before the European Court of Human Rights .....	211
A.	The Content of the Comment.....	211
B.	Identifiability of the Author .....	212
C.	The Content Provider .....	213
D.	The Party Attacked .....	213
E.	The Effect of the Comment on the Party Attacked .....	214
F.	The Conduct of the Content Provider .....	214
G.	Sanctions Applied .....	215
H.	Summary .....	216

IV.	Main Criticism of the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights .....	216
A.	Liability of a Gatekeeper (Content Provider) .....	216
B.	Importance of the ‘Economic Service’ .....	217
C.	Expecting Moderation.....	218
D.	Assessment of the Comment’s Content .....	218
V.	The Case of Social Media Comments .....	219
VI.	Summary .....	220
7.	The Future of Regulating Gatekeepers .....	222
I.	Introduction .....	222
II.	Possible Interpretations of Existing Legal Doctrines Concerning the Public Sphere .....	223
A.	Media Regulation.....	223
B.	The Law of Electronic Commerce.....	225
C.	The Law of Contract.....	225
D.	The Law of Public Forums.....	227
E.	The Chances of Finding a Comprehensive Regulatory Solution .....	229
III.	The Possible Models of Future European Regulation .....	230
A.	Transferring the US Model to Europe.....	230
B.	Preserving the Status Quo through Limited Regulatory Intervention (Weaker Co-regulation Model).....	231
C.	Strengthening Government Regulation (Stronger Co-regulation Model).....	235
D.	Prohibiting Private Regulation .....	239
IV.	Summary .....	241
	<i>Index</i> .....	243